

“.....給每天與玩偶們遊戲的小霞.....”

劉曉波1999年的一首詩副標題

幾年前，我第一次看到劉曉波與劉霞的玩偶娃娃之一的照片，那個娃娃坐在他肩頭。那是個美好溫柔的形象，娃娃依偎著他的耳朵，被他的手緊握著；當然娃娃之小，使劉似乎比真人更大。反襯空白背景的姿態，幾乎是英雄般的——正像你可能會在宣傳標語或海報上看到的。劉和娃娃都注視著旁邊不近不遠之處，兩者都不大喜歡所看到的東西。一眼看去，那娃娃幾乎像個孩子，直到我細看，才看出那的確是個玩偶。值得注意的是，它是本次展會有完整人像存在的唯一照片，其他幾個有些手指，一隻手，或實際上是一個拳頭。

這個特殊玩偶的一個顯著特點，就是他那扭曲張開的嘴——吼，無聲的喊叫。正是這個特點，或許也就是這組攝影集的標誌，因為它如此精確地傳達了它們作為一個整體所描繪的一切，那無言無聞的無辜者之無可奈何，憤怒無助。攝影集這方面以形象構造的方式得到反響：彎曲成鶯扭姿態的玩偶們，時裹時綁，使用家常土產材料——玻璃紙屑，木頭碎片，成疊軟布，梯級椅背，鳥籠，小蠟燭。這是女孩有時如何玩娃娃：扭它們四肢，剪它們頭髮，打它們，在空中拋。她們用手頭的材料精心虛構一些黑暗故事。

與這個展覽相對應的，我們已經看到《劉曉波詩文選：沒有敵人，也沒有仇恨》（*No Enemies, No Hatred: Selected Essays and Poems*）英文版發行（Belknap/Harvard,2011）。那些文章由劉霞所選擇，是劉曉波20多年思考和創作的概括，涉及廣泛的問題——六四屠殺，漢人在西藏，激進的極端民族主義，中國政府的奧運“金牌綜合症”，互聯網使旺盛的無政府狀態成為可能。

當我讀這些文章而對劉霞的照片反應時，我被三件事所觸動。首先，劉曉波寫了大量有關中國青少年的文字。他不停地與六四遇難者的母親們一起哀悼，列出遇難青年的姓名和情況，表達他的內疚，因為“風雲人物如我一樣，無一傷亡”。他問難：“為什麼付出最大的生命代價的人們（劉霞的玩偶們在他們的蠟燭群中），大都默默無聞、無權講述歷史，而那些作為倖存者的精英們卻有權喋喋不休？”他寫了中國一胎化人口政策所造成的、充滿“絕對利己主義”的“小皇帝”。他追索2007年有關河南省“黑窯”剝削童奴的醜聞（像玻璃紙窒息的玩偶們），是2009年審判中被用做“煽動顛覆國家政權罪”有罪證據的文章之一。

其次，劉探索了“文化與社會”中許多參與者的角色，作家和知識分子，色情電影，像

哈維爾、甘地和耶穌基督一類的西方英雄人物。在一篇文章中，他考察了“惡搞”在破壞極權主義中的至關重要作用。“真話政治是少數良知人士不畏強暴的公開挑戰，玩笑運動是沉默大多數的私下挖牆角……”。他提供的藝術上顛覆性幽默的許多例子之一，是藝術家方力鈞的“呆痴化禿頭”系列，以一些目瞪口呆的角色體現“以醜為美”的原則。劉霞的“醜娃娃”，具有怒視的大眼和張開的嘴巴（沒什麼不同於方那些“吼”畫像），也許還不是作為公然諷刺，但都有深刻的顛覆性。在關於鎮壓和無力的藝術作品中，使用玩偶——“娃娃”是兒童劇的一種挑釁性滑稽模仿。它不會像劉曉波列舉的某些更憤世嫉俗的“惡搞”形式那樣引人大笑，但它借鑒了類似的共同私人經驗，並激發一種純粹無畏。每個人都玩娃娃，不是嗎？

最後，最明顯的是，這兩人正在就他們作品的言語談話。幾乎四分之一的劉霞照片使用言語或者書——成堆的書，一個娃娃擠進了一個書架的角落，言語的掩飾使娃娃避開觀眾。書是自豪和恐嚇之源，而娃娃在書堆旁渺小而脆弱。對於劉曉波本人而言，作家是其英雄，言語是其武器，是他重構中國民主的磚瓦。它們也都是他失敗的原因，他在2009年被判處11年徒刑，就是由於他那些有

說服力的優雅句子中的七句話，總共才224個中文字。

一些評論者已經指出，劉霞寧願政治中立，不直接介入公開批評中國政權。她不是天安門廣場事件的積極參與者，也不是《零八憲章》的簽署者。但她仍被處罰。她的作品在中國被禁。2010年10月以來，她一直被拘禁，遏制，雖然從無任何指控或定罪。她自2010年10月以來被禁閉在北京她的公寓裡，幾乎就是她丈夫劉曉波被囚禁的一種滑稽模仿。她可能就是那個被描繪成困在像形文字背後的娃娃，向外看，就像一個女人在一個窗口；或者那個明亮金屬籠子裡的娃娃，等待著，在一個點燃的蠟燭旁邊。（這一套照片是在劉曉波目前囚禁前十年完成的，但禁閉、探訪、詩歌交流、缺席、沉默的模式，早已是他們生活的故事。）

在攝影集最後的圖像中，吼叫的娃娃陷入在我看來是兩個獅頭之間，或許是門環。他沒法下來，直到有人移去他；然後，也許他身後的門將盪開。在此之前，他被囚禁和噤聲。但劉曉波的話仍可以聽到，看到，朗誦出來：“我期待我的國家是一片可以自由表達的土地，……在這裡，所有的政見都將攤在陽光下接受民眾的選擇，……我期待，我將是中國綿綿不絕的文字獄的最後一個受害者……”

瑪麗安·博茨福德·弗雷澤

(Marian Botsford Fraser)

國際筆會獄中作家委員會主席

加拿大多倫多

2012年5月

pen
INTERNATIONAL

An Artist Couple's Diary

By Tienchi Martin-Liao, President
of the Independent Chinese PEN
Center (ICPC)

Two extraordinary persons – he is a literary critic, writer and human rights activist and she a painter, poet and photographer – are bound together by a common destination. He fights fiercely with his words against a repressive regime that stifles political and artistic freedom, and she bravely struggles with the consequences of his incarceration.

In these allegorical photos presented here, we see an artistic rendition of the daily lives of Liu Xiaobo, the Nobel Peace Laureate and his wife Liu Xia inside a big prison called China. The photos are set inside tall walls, behind sturdy iron bars, on gigantic cliff rocks, amid ominous men in shadows and in the middle of desolate wilderness. The subjects that populate the photos are not humans, but dolls, which hide nervously behind and among piles of books, perched alone on the edge of a steep cliff, locked inside a cage or squelched by a merciless hand. These lifeless toys become alive, sharing with the outside world the stories of dismay, pain, solitude, defiance and resilience.

Ironically, the photos, taken by Liu Xia years before, offered a prescient glimpse of her present life. Her husband has been imprisoned by the Chinese authorities since December 2008 for the fourth time, serving an eleven-year sentence on charges of

“inciting subversion of state power.” His incarceration led to Liu Xia’s house arrest, a more torturous form of punishment. At this very time, Liu Xia is living under 24-hour surveillance by the public security police – a group of faceless men lurking around her apartment like shadows. While her husband might have the companionship of fellow inmates, Liu Xia is alone, her contacts with the outside world – with her friends or relatives or the media – being completely cut off.

To Liu Xia, police threats and imprisonment are nothing new. In 1996, she married Liu Xiaobo and their wedding took place inside a labor camp, where the groom was to be held for three years on charges of “disturbing social order.” Over the years, as her husband was in and out of jail, Liu Xia had faced indefatigably the constant police harassment and loneliness. There is no doubt that the living circumstances cast a strong influence over her photographic works. There is a popular Chinese saying, “The loss for the state is a win for the poet.” The agony and sorrow the couple has endured have shaped their writings, making them exceptional artists of our time.

It has been more than 60 years since China has been subjected to the authoritarian rule of the Communist Party. More than 40 million Chinese have lost their lives, not because of

war or natural catastrophe, but due to political persecution, which continues today. The Party silences dissent, restricts freedom of the press and prohibits free expression. Those who dare speak out against the Party have ended up in jail, like Liu Xiaobo.

Fortunately, the development of the internet has, to a certain degree, broken the Party’s control over the free flow of information and enabled many dissidents to promote the messages of democracy and freedom online. Liu Xiaobo’s writings, all of which have been banned in China, and Liu Xia’s photos, which remain unpublished and unexhibited there, are now accessible on the internet and have received overwhelmingly favorable responses from the many mainland Chinese who have managed to access them via overseas websites.

We hope more political changes come to China soon. Liu Xia and Liu Xiaobo’s writings and artistic works, scheduled to be on display in Europe, North America and parts of Asia, could become the harbinger of spring and warm the cold and harshness of mainland China, where the couple now lives separately, in their prisons.

一對患難伉儷的藝術對話

廖天琪，獨立中文筆會會長

命運把兩位不平凡的藝術家緊緊地繫絆在一起。他，用手中的筆把鋒利的思想用煉達的語言寫出來；她，用自己善感的心靈和敏銳的眼睛記錄了一切。兩個人卻都同樣地要面對中國的現實：高牆、絲網、柵欄、妖魔和無處不在的黑衣人。攝像鏡頭下的娃娃，驚恐、顫抖，被勒喉或禁閉於籠中，但是他們不屈服，不斷發出巨大無聲的吶喊。娃娃們披露了藝術家劉霞和劉曉波這對患難夫妻的生存現狀。他是第四次被投入監獄，這次他要坐牢11年。而因為他，她也失去了自由，沒有法庭，也沒有審判，整天跟那些如影隨形的灰衣國保生活在黑暗之中。曉波還知道自己的命運：11年，而她，卻不知。她生活在全然的孤島之中，跟外界斷絕了一切聯繫，親朋也不能見，只有那些男男女女的影子人，日日夜夜包圍着她。

她似乎已經有了預感，劉霞多年以來就借她的娃娃把她丈夫的苦難記錄了下來：娃娃們隱身在書頁裡，藏匿在書架或書堆之中，一臉的驚懼和苦痛。有時候在可能粉身碎骨的斷木邊緣，有時候又被關在籠子裡或被一隻大手捏得眼珠迸裂、魂飛魄散。自然，還有那些幽靈一般、沒有面孔的黑衣人無孔不入……

攝影家劉霞也是詩人，她敏感而易受傷害。

她和曉波的婚姻注定了不會為她提供舒適的棲身之地，當然這也並非她所追求的。二人的婚禮是1996年在獄中舉行的，為了取得妻子身份，以便去探監，她就嫁了這個剛被判刑三年的政治犯。作為文學評論家、政論家和理論思想家的劉曉波，在監獄裡成了勤快的詩人，他獄中所寫的幾十首美麗的詩都是獻給心愛的霞的。我們不知道劉霞何時拍的這些照片，但是他倆的特殊生存環境，直接影響彼此的文學和藝術創作，他們是夫妻，也是精神上的伴侶和同道，各自用自己的藝術形式，不斷地進行對話，相互鼓勵扶持，世間的神仙眷屬末此為過。

中國有句諺語：“國家不幸詩家幸。”苦難和憂患的確為我們塑造了這一對當代優秀的文學和藝術家。以往一甲子的時間裡，中國共產黨統治國家，造成非災非難的和平時期裡，4千萬人白白喪失了生命，這是人為的錯誤政策和教條的意識形態鬥爭所結的惡果。犯下歷史性罪惡的中共政權，至今仍然掌權當政，因此反思和檢討以往罪責的課題依然屬於禁忌的領域。審查制度讓人們噤聲，思想和言論的自由都遭到剝奪。任何敢於跟黨逆向而行的言行，都將遭到劉氏夫婦同樣的命運。曉波的作品在國內被禁，劉霞的攝影在自己的國度內被視為“異化變質的藝術”。然而網路的廣被，已經衝破禁區，

跨越界限。曉波的文章在網上廣為流傳，劉霞的娃娃喊出了同胞們的心聲。人們早就厭倦了政治的陳詞濫調和官方機器的宣傳。尋常百姓需要能宣泄他們情感和心靈的作品。劉霞的作品沒有機會在中國展出，但是一旦人們能看到她的攝影，他們會喜歡的。

中國的政治經濟和社會上積壓的問題已經超負荷了，政改勢在必行，許多人相信中國不久將會有較大的轉變，也許劉霞的作品就是無數報春的信使之一，它們已然在海外和香港流傳了，但願它們跟國內觀眾見面的時間不會太久了。

Communicating in Gestures

By Cui Weiping, Professor, the Academy of Cinema, Peking

In November 1996 a strange wedding ceremony took place at a labor reeducation camp in the north China city of Dalian. The groom, Liu Xiaobo, had arrived there shortly after being arrested two months earlier and now faced three years of labor reeducation. The bride, Liu Xia, a Beijing poet, had once had a good job, but had been investigated by the police for her friendship with Liao Yiwu and was now an independent writer. (Liao Yiwu had received a three year sentence in 1990 for his long poem “Massacre” and his photographs commemorating June Fourth.)

It was Liu Xiaobo’s second encounter with the law. The first time he spent two and a half years in jail for his involvement in June Fourth. Each time he lost his freedom, Liu was caught by surprise; otherwise he probably would have made better arrangements in advance. As it was, the wedding ceremony was only a simple lunch, after which Liu Xia returned to Beijing, leaving Liu Xiaobo to undergo his labor reform. Liu Xia later explained why she insisted on a labor camp wedding by saying, “Once we were married, I had the legal right to visit him.”

Liu Xiaobo wrote in a poem,

We had no wedding certificate,

**No legal guarantee,
God did not witness us.**

**We planted our tree in the sand,
Our wedding chamber in a cell,
Embracing and kissing
Under the jailers’ gaze.**
(November 17, 1996)

At the end of this poem Liu alluded to the 19th-century English novel Wuthering Heights by Emily Brontë. That he did so revealed a secret: like Heathcliff and Catherine as described by this female writer, the new couple had the same fervent love for freedom, the same rough, true souls. This was the unique basis of their love.

During his three years of labor reeducation, Liu Xiaobo wrote many poems for his wife. They reached her only after passing through the labor camp’s censorship system. Under the circumstances he could not write about politics, so his emotions flowed like a torrent into his poetry. He used a variety of terms of endearment in addressing Liu Xia, and wrote many moving lines. For example, in a poem called “Your lifelong prisoner,” he wrote, “I’m your lifelong prisoner, my love; I want to live in your dark insides.”[1] In some ways Liu’s poems can be understood in the same way as the “Letters to Olga” of the former Czech dissident Havel. The process of writing a poem is a process of drawing near to oneself, a process of introspection.

Liu Xia, who had been writing poetry for a longer time, addressed fewer poems directly to Liu Xiaobo during this period. Her 1982 narrative poem, “The Story of the Sea,” had been openly published. The first time I saw Liu Xia, in 1986, she had just published a piece of experimental fiction that was much noticed by young writers of the time. In much the same way as in Eastern Europe at that time, during a political freeze young people expressed their yearning for a life of freedom by showing a passion for art and literary endeavor. Liu Xia was always surrounded by a group of vanguard literary figures and diverse artists. She had painted in oil since childhood, and was good at this too.

It was just when she embarked on her monthly marches to the Dalian labor camp that Liu Xia started to take photographs of dolls. The coincidence in timing can help us understand the photographs. Given Liu Xia’s private nature and her self-possession, she would not have been willing to let expressions of her yearning, empathy, and support for her husband fall into the hands of the camp’s censors. She needed to find some other way to express herself, as Liu Xiaobo had done. Better than expressing herself in words, she knew that photographs which at first glance appear bizarre, would confuse the ever-present “jailers’ gaze.”

She wanted to avoid not only that gaze, but the noisy, profane world, the human stage thronged with actors made up for various roles. If these two like-minded souls both hated fakery, between the two of them Liu Xiaobo was the one with a life of big ups and downs, tossed on the waves of the era, lifted up, then suddenly cast down to the depths; while Liu Xia was a person of an authenticity such as I have seldom encountered, who lived and felt with a rare, simple honesty. She was never comfortable with the glamorous aspect of Liu Xiaobo’s life and kept her distance from it. During the second year of her trips to the labor camp she wrote, “At a moment of defenseless fragility, an unrehearsed drama began. The spotlight betrayed ... a role that should have been soft and sad.”

This is why the dolls - the raw material of her art - are all “ugly kids” instead of lovely dolls. This is the true self behind the stage curtain. Such “ugliness” can face oneself, can face the darkness within one’s heart, can hear the howls within, including those of collapse. A friend told me that one year when he went to Brazil he asked Liu Xiaobo whether he needed him to bring anything back, and Liu told him to bring some ugly dolls for Liu Xia to photograph. But when he brought them, Liu Xiaobo said they would not do, because “they are too pretty.”

The dolls in the photographs are pictured as physically unable to move, as entirely passive, and yet their spirits burst forth, expressing anger and resistance. In the photo on p. 14 of the catalogue four dolls are lined up wrapped in transparent plastic, trapped so they cannot breathe; yet they stick out their necks and stare angrily before them. On p. 40 a doll is tightly squeezed between two rocks against a wasteland-like background, but expresses his resistance not only through his glaring eyes but with the strip of white cloth covered with words wrapped around his head. Then there is the doll on p. 41, seized by a huge hand, and the one on p. 42, simply thrust into a bird-cage, and the one on p. 43, squeezed between two stalks of bamboo so that it cannot get out.

Most often seen is a male doll. We can interpret this as Liu Xia’s way of getting closer to, empathizing with, and touching her imprisoned husband. But it can also be understood as expressing Liu Xia’s own situation and spiritual condition. How did Brontë’s Catherine put it? “I AM Heathcliff! He’s always, always in my mind: not as a pleasure, but as my own being.” Therefore, not only is Liu Xiaobo a challenger, Liu Xia herself is a challenger. Spiritually, they are indistinguishable and of equal importance. In the two photos on p. 21 and p. 44, the same doll – who is hanging halfway into the void in different postures, being

tortured under the open sky, losing freedom on behalf of freedom – should be seen as a single being of both sexes. And in some photos male and female dolls appear together, such as on p. 45, where they are fenced in by the bars of a chair, the male doll’s chest bound, and the female doll seemingly drawn to the core of the earth. Perhaps we can see this as a portrayal of the artist and her husband.

Consider the first poem that Liu Xia ever wrote for Liu Xiaobo, on June 2, 1989, less than 48 hours before the shooting started, at a time when Liu Xiaobo was on hunger strike in Tiananmen Square. Liu Xia wrote, “I didn’t even get a word in with you. You have become a news personality. ...I could only hide away from the crowd, have a smoke, and look at the sky.” In the photo on p. 46, the male and female dolls are separated by a pillar like the stone pillars in front of the gate at Tiananmen. One is shouting, the other is quietly watching, just like the two of them at the Square that year. The pain of June Fourth, 1989, shared by all our people, is an important bond between these two. In the three photos on pages 18, 19, and 47, the tightly covered, faceless ghost should be seen as a profound memorial to the lost souls of June Fourth: so too the picture on p. 48 with its bed of candles. Still today, these lost souls and their families cannot speak, cannot appear in public; and people cannot

publicly express grief for their deaths.

Books were a special passion for these two. “When I am alone/ I often see/you take my hand/ We walk within book after book/ Our hearts full of sadness” (Liu Xia, February 1997). We see some photographs that are related to books (pp. 27, 29, 49, and 50). The one in which a small person stands between two stacks of thick books [49] represents Liu Xiaobo’s former life. He was a fast reader. When Liu Xia migrated like a bird between Dalian and Beijing, she brought him tomes. As Liu Xiaobo told me, in labor reeducation you were not allowed to read political books, but you could read Thomas Mann, Dostoevsky, Kafka and so on, and that is why we have the picture on p. 28 of a trussed-up doll kneeling before an open book. Sometimes the photos contain a small joke. For example, the male doll on p. 50 standing on a kind of stilt points with his left hand to a group of books as if to say “It was them, this is how it all started.” What he points to are translations of American works by Thoreau, Emerson, and Poe. These were some of the sources of Liu Xiaobo’s thought.

Because of them, a gap had opened up between Liu Xiaobo and the Chinese tradition. Somewhat earlier his violent attacks on traditional Chinese culture had been widely criticized. Liu Xiaobo was similar in this way to Lu Xun (1881-1936),

who is considered a representative figure of China’s new culture. This standard-bearer of 20th-century Chinese culture had written in one of his fictional works, “All over this [Chinese] history is written two words: ‘Eat people.’” This famous sentence exposes and indicts China’s dictatorial system and traditional political culture. In some photographs dolls are trapped behind pictographs, their tongues lolling out of their mouths but seeming unable to speak, as if they were corpses (pages 24, 51, and 52). On p. 53, the protagonist is squeezed between the two halves of a heavy metal door, suggesting a tense relationship with the traditional Chinese imperial system. The irony is that it is precisely those who are the severest critics of the culture of their own country who over the course of time come to be considered their culture’s representatives. By bringing in other sources, they enrich their own people’s traditions.

Liu Xiaobo must have seen some of these photographs while he was in labor camp. He referred to them in a poem written a few months before he finished his sentence (August 31, 1989). In this poem, entitled “Tell it to the Dolls – For Liu Xia Who Plays Every Day with Dolls,” he wrote, “When you tell it to the dolls/ Avoid the truth/ Just use the names/ But leave out/The facts.” “All you have subverted with

the dolls/ Are your own poems.” Clearly these photos of dolls, even as they express something, also in some way hide it. More accurately, they are a form of “smuggling.” Just as Liu Xiaobo’s poems cannot be published in China, so these photographs by Liu Xia also cannot be publicly exhibited there.

These photos of sufferers are also the piercing cry of free spirits. As Liu Xia herself wrote of them,

**Living together with the dolls,
Surrounded by the power of silence,
The world open around us,
We communicate in gestures.**

(“The Power of Silence,” November 1998).

[1] Translation of these lines by Susan Wilf, in Liu Xiaobo, No Enemies, No Hatred: Selected Essays and Poems, Perry Link et al., eds. (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2012), p. 175.

沉默的力量無所不在

崔衛平，北京電影學院教授

1996年11月，位於中國北部城市大連的一所勞教所裡，舉行了一場奇特的婚禮。新郎劉曉波，兩個月前被捕之後很快來到了這裡，他將面臨長達三年的勞教。新娘劉霞，北京詩人，原來有一份不錯的工作，現為自由作家。因與朋友廖亦武的友誼接受過警方調查。

這是劉曉波第二次吃官司。第一次因為“八九·六四”被捕入獄兩年半。而每一回失去自由，劉曉波本人都沒有事先料到，否則他或許會好好安排一下自己的生活。婚禮只是一場簡單的午飯，飯後劉霞回北京，留下劉曉波接受“勞動改造”。劉霞後來解釋為甚麼一定要在牢房裡舉行婚禮，理由是“一旦結婚，我就可以合法地看望他了”。

劉曉波在詩中寫道：“我們的婚禮沒有證明/沒有法律的保證/也沒有上帝的注視/如同沙漠中的一棵樹 我們的新房是一件囚室/我們的擁抱和接吻/有警察監視的目光”（1996年11月27日）。這首詩的末尾，提到了十九世紀英國作家艾米莉·勃朗特的小說《呼嘯山莊》。這個細節泄露了一個秘密：像女作家筆下的主人公希斯克里夫與凱瑟琳一樣，這對新夫妻有著同樣熱愛自由的本性，同樣真實而粗糲的靈魂。這是他們愛情的獨特基礎。

三年勞教，劉曉波寫了大量的詩歌給妻子。它們是在勞教所的審查制度之後，抵達劉霞手中。在失去自由的情況下，他不能從事政治寫作，於是他的詩情便一發而不可收。他對劉霞用了許多親暱的稱呼，寫下了許多感人的詩句。這首題為《我是你的終身囚徒》寫道：“親愛的，我是你的終身囚徒/寧願永遠活在你的黑暗中。”劉曉波的這批詩，在某種意義上，可以與捷克前不同政見者哈維爾的《給奧爾嘉的信》做平行的理解。寫詩的過程是一個人接近自己的過程，是他自我反省的過程。

比較起來，更早從事詩歌寫作的劉霞，這個期間卻少有直接題獻給劉曉波的詩。1982年劉霞寫的敘事詩《海的故事》，便在刊物上公開發表。1986年我第一次見到劉霞時，她剛剛發表了一篇實驗文體的小說，在當時的青年作家中令人矚目。與當年東歐的某些情況非常相似，在政治凍結的情況下，年輕人熱愛藝術，追求寫作，表達了他們對於自由生活嚮往。劉霞的身邊，始終活躍著一個先鋒文學及各類藝術家的群體。劉霞自幼習油畫，她在油畫方面也頗有心得。

踏上每月一次往返大連勞教所的征程，正是劉霞拍攝這批以玩偶為主題照片的開始。這兩個行為在時間上完全重合，可以幫助我們

更好地理解這批照片。根據劉霞羞澀而突出的個性，她應該不願意將對於丈夫思念，對於丈夫的理解和支持，落到勞教所審查制度官員的手中。她需要轉換一種表達途徑，就像劉曉波已經完成的轉換一樣。比較用文字來表達，這批看似怪異的照片，只會令站在一旁的“警察監視的目光”感到困惑。

所要躲開的不僅是警察的目光，還有那個喧囂的世俗世界，那個塗著各種花臉油脂的人生舞台。這兩個互相分享著的靈魂都痛恨虛偽，但是比較起來，劉曉波的生活大起大落，他被時代的巨浪拋起，轉眼又沉到浪谷的深處。而劉霞是我見到的少有的本真之人，很少有人像她那樣率真地生活和感受，幾十年如一日。對於劉曉波生活中“耀眼”的一面，她始終感到不適，甚至保持冷眼的距離。在她往返於勞教所的第二年（1997年）她寫道：“在毫無防備的脆弱時刻/一出沒有彩排過的戲上演了 我被耀眼的燈光出賣……/原本悲哀並且柔和的角色。”

這也許就是為甚麼用做素材的玩偶都是“丑娃娃”，而不是美麗洋娃娃的原因。這是帷幕後面的那部分真實的自我。這種“丑”，是能夠面對自身，面對自身內心中的黑暗，能夠聽取自身體內各種呼嘯的聲音，有時候也是崩潰的聲音。我的同事郝建談到，有一

年他去巴西之前問劉曉波需要帶些甚麼，劉說帶些丑娃娃給劉霞拍照。結果帶回來之後，劉曉波直說這些不行，因為“它們太漂亮了”。

照片中丑娃娃們身體完全不能動彈，限於徹底被動，但是它們的精神仍然飽滿，仍然在表達憤怒和抗議。這一張四個並排的丑娃娃被透明塑料紙包裹著，被憋在裡面不能呼吸，但是仍然挺直脖子，向著前方怒目而視。這一張中的丑娃娃則出現在一個荒蕪的背景之上，被兩塊大石頭緊緊夾住，然而不僅是那雙瞪圓的眼睛表達出它的抗議，還有頭上繫著的那塊寫著字詞的白布條，這可以看做“八九· 六四”的延伸表達。還有這張被一隻大手攥在手中，這張則乾脆被關進鳥籠之中，這張被夾在兩顆竹子之間走不出來，都是對於身處現實處境的抗議。

人們看到更多的是一位男娃娃，這可以看作是劉霞通過這種方式來接近、理解和觸摸她被囚禁的丈夫。但是，這同樣也可以看做劉霞本人處境和精神狀態的一種表達。那位凱瑟琳怎麼說來著？“我就是希斯克利夫!他永遠地在我心裡。他並不是作為一種樂趣，卻是作為我自己本身而存在。”

因此，不僅劉曉波是一位挑戰者，劉霞本人

亦是一名挑戰者。從內在的精神來說，他們彼此不可分割，且分量相當。這兩幅中，同一個丑娃娃以不同的姿態被懸在半空中，在藍天下受刑，為了自由而失去自由，應該視為雌雄同體的一對。其中也有男娃娃與女娃娃同時出現，如這幅以一把椅子代表著的柵欄裡面，男娃娃胸部被綁著，女娃娃仿佛被地心裡的深淵所吸引，這也許可以視為他們兩個人的寫照。

能夠讀到劉霞第一首寫給劉曉波的詩，是在1989年6月2日，離開槍的時間不到48小時，此時劉曉波正在廣場上絕食。劉霞寫道：“我沒有來得及與你說上一句話，/你成了新聞人物……只好躲到人群外面/抽支煙/望著天”。我們來看這幅照片，男女娃娃被象徵著天安門的華表所分割，一個發出吶喊，一個躲在一旁靜靜地看著，就像當年他們兩人在廣場。“八九· 六四”這個共同的民族之痛，是將這兩人連結在一起的重要紐帶。這些照片中，被緊緊裹著的失去面孔的幽靈，應該是對於“6· 4”亡靈的深深祭奠，包括這幅遍地的蠟燭。至今，這些亡靈們與他們的家屬仍然不能開口，不能在公開場合下露面，人們也不能公開表達對於死難者的哀思。

書籍是這兩個人最為熱衷的愛好。“獨自

一人時/我常常看到/你牽著我的手/我們一起走在一本又一本書中/心中充滿悲涼。”（劉霞，1997年2月）。我們也看到了一些與書籍有關的照片，一個小人站在兩大排厚厚的書本中間，這是劉曉波此前的日常生活，這個人讀書讀得飛快。當劉霞像準時的候鳥奔波於大連與北京之間，她帶去了一些大部頭的書。

聽曉波說起過，勞教期間不允許看政治的書籍，但是可以看托· 馬斯曼、陀思妥耶夫斯基或者卡夫卡等，於是就有了這幅被五花大綁捆著的娃娃，跪在一本攤開的大書面前。有時候也會有一些小小的玩笑。比如這幅站在一只高蹺上的男娃娃，左手食指指著一堆書籍，仿佛在說“就是他”、“事情的原因就在這裡”。那是一些翻譯版的美國書籍，作者有梭羅、愛默生及愛倫坡。這些是劉曉波汲取的思想資源的一部分。

劉曉波因而與中國傳統之間有了一些裂隙。早些時候，他對於中國傳統文化的激烈抨擊，遭致了來自多方面的批評。在這一點上，劉曉波與中國新文化的代表人物之一魯迅先生（1881——1936）有著許多共同之處。這位20世紀初的中國文化旗手在他的小說中寫道：“這曆史上歪歪斜斜著兩個字——‘吃人’”，這句話非常有名，是對

於中國專制制度及傳統政治文化和的揭示和控訴。

這些照片中有一些被困在象形文字中的娃娃，它們仿佛拖著舌頭，但不能說話，帶有一些屍體的氣息。還有這幅，主人公被夾在一扇大鐵門中間，同樣表達了與皇權制度的傳統中國之間的一種緊張關係。事情就是這樣詭異，往往越是批評本國傳統文化的人，經過時間推移，越是被看做本國文化的一位代表。因為他引進了另外一些源頭，豐富了自己本民族的傳統。

勞教中的劉曉波應該是看到其中某些照片的，在他結束苦役前幾個月（1999年8月31日）的一首詩中提到了它們。這首詩名為《對玩偶們訴說——給每天與玩偶們遊戲的小霞》，其中寫道：“向玩偶們訴說/最好免於真情/只保留名字/把對應的事實/統統拋棄”。“而你用玩偶們顛覆的/僅僅是自己的詩句”。顯然，這些玩偶的照片，既是表達，又是一種掩蓋。更準確地說，是“走私”。如衛劉曉波的詩歌不能在中國出版，劉霞的這批照片也不能在中國公開展出。

這批奇特的照片，可以看作這對夫婦自由精神的尖銳呼嘯。劉霞自己這樣寫道：

和玩偶們一起生活

沉默的力量無所不在

世界四面敞開

我們在手勢中交流。

（《沉默的力量》1998年11月）

謹以此文表達對於劉霞、劉曉波的深切思念（2011年10月6日）

On Liu Xia 論劉霞

Andrew J. Nathan Class of 1919
Professor of Political Science,
Columbia University
黎友安（Andrew J. Nathan）
哥倫比亞大學政治學教授

Liu Xia is best known to the world as the wife of Nobel Peace Prize winner Liu Xiaobo, and as the victim of a protracted siege of extralegal house arrest that has been imposed upon her by the Chinese authorities ever since Liu was named for the prize. Less well known is that she is a major Chinese artistic figure in her own right. Born in Beijing in 1959, Liu Xia developed her talents as an artist and writer. In the relatively liberal 1980s she was an active member of the lively modernist literary and art scene that flourished in Beijing. It was then that she fell in love with the controversial young college professor and public intellectual Liu Xiaobo. Liu Xiaobo moved into Liu Xia's apartment, owned by her one-time employer, the Beijing tax office.

The two are very different in personality. Liu Xia once told a Western journalist, "I am not politically involved. I behave as if I live in a different world. We discuss politics as little as possible at home. My husband knows that it doesn't interest me." [1] Cui Weiping in her essay for this catalogue describes her unwillingness to get involved in the public drama of Tiananmen in 1989. Yet she stood by Liu Xiaobo during his imprisonment after Tiananmen in 1989-91 and again during a period of so-called house arrest which he suffered at an unknown location in Beijing in 1995-1996. When he was committed for a term of labor reeducation in

1996, Liu Xia applied to the camp authorities for permission to marry him.

Her association with Liu Xiaobo has cost Liu Xia her right to display and publish her creative work. Her work has been banned in China since 1989, even though she was not a participant in Tiananmen and did not sign Charter 08, the liberal manifesto that triggered Liu Xiaobo's latest and longest prison sentence, an 11-year sentence imposed in December 2009.

Guy Sorman has obtained the remarkable photos in this exhibition, which were created by Liu Xia during the time of Liu Xiaobo's labor reeducation in 1996-1999, and her consent to exhibit them. These strangely disturbing and moving photographs reveal profound truths about today's China, not only in their content and style, but also in the history of their creation, suppression, and now, their exhibition abroad.

[1] *Spiegel Online International*, "Government Officials Like to Make People Suffer," November 11, 2010, at <http://www.spiegel.de/international/world/0,1518,722392,00.html>, accessed January 9, 2012.

劉霞最為世人所知，一是作為諾貝爾和平獎獲得者劉曉波的妻子，二是作為長期遭受軟禁的受害者，自從劉曉波獲得諾獎以來她一直遭中國當局非法軟禁。劉霞不為世人所知的，則是她本身就是一個中國藝術界的重要人物。劉霞在1959年生於北京，她展示了藝術和寫作的才能，在相對自由的上世紀八十年代，現代派文學藝術在北京蓬勃發展，劉霞就是當時活躍的一員。就在那個時候，她愛上了具有爭議的年輕大學教授、公共知識分子劉曉波。劉曉波隨後搬入了劉霞的公寓，該公寓屬於劉霞曾經工作的北京市稅務局。

這兩個人在性格上迥然不同。劉霞曾經告訴西方記者：“我並不介入政治，我彷彿生活在另外一個世界。我們在家裡盡可能不談政治。我丈夫知道政治引不起我的興趣。” [1] 崔衛平在為這個圖錄所撰寫的文章中談到了她不願意捲入1989年的天安門政治風波。但是她在天安門事件後劉曉波被監禁期間（1989-91）和在北京未知地點遭軟禁期間（1995-96）支持他。1996年當劉曉波在接受勞動教養時，劉霞向勞教所申請與他結婚。劉霞與劉曉波的結合使她失去了展示和出版其藝術作品的權利。她的作品自1989年起在中國被禁，儘管她並未參與天安門事件，也沒有簽署《零八憲章》；正因為

《零八憲章》這一自由宣言導致了劉曉波最近一次而且是最長時間的監禁，他於2009年12月被判入獄十一年。

居伊·索爾曼獲得了此次展出中的傑出照片，並獲得劉霞的許可將其展出。這些照片為劉霞1996-1999年劉曉波勞動教養時所作。這些令人感覺奇怪、不安和震動的照片，不僅在其內容和風格上，也從其創作、被禁和現在在海外展出的過程中，展示了關於當今中國的極為深刻的真相。



